



*KŪKULU KE EA A KANALOA*  
**KAHO‘OLAWE ISLAND RESERVE COMMISSION**

811 Kolu Street, Suite 201, Wailuku, HI 96793  
Telephone (808) 243-5020 Fax (808) 243-5885  
Website: <http://kahoolawe.hawaii.gov>

COMMISSION MEMBERS

JOSHUA KAAKUA, Ed.D  
*Chairperson*  
CARMEN HULU LINDSEY  
*Vice-Chair*

SUZANNE CASE  
‘ĀNELA EVANS  
SAUMALU MATAAFA  
BENTON KEALII PANG, Ph.D  
MICHELLE PESCAIA

Michael K. Nāho‘opi‘i  
*Executive Director*

**DRAFT PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES**

**Wednesday, November 9, 2022**

1:00 pm

In person at 1151 Punchbowl St, Room 227

Honolulu, HI

Online via ZOOM and livestreamed via YouTube

**COMMISSION MEMBERS**

**PRESENT:** Josh Kaakua, E.D., Chairperson; Carmen Hulu Lindsey, Vice-Chair (joined at 1:16 pm); Suzanne Case; Saumalu Mataafa (joined at 1:32 pm); Benton Kealii Pang, Ph.D; Michelle Pescaia

**EXCUSED:** ‘Ānela Evans

**KIRC STAFF:** Michael Nāho‘opi‘i, Executive Director (ED); Matthew Hatakeyama, Administrative Officer (AO); Daniel Morris, Deputy Attorney General (DAG) (joined at 1:29 pm); Terri Gavagan, Commission Coordinator (CC); Margaret Pulver, Public Information Specialist (PIS); Dean Tokishi, Ocean Resources Program Manager (ORPM); Cassandra Smith, Volunteer Coordinator (VC); Lopaka White, Maintenance & Vessel Operator (MVO); Grant Thompson, Logistics Specialist (LS)

**IN PERSON**

**GUESTS:** Keoni Fairbanks

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 1:02 pm. Roll call was conducted, and quorum was established with four Commissioners.

**II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**A. Minutes of July 1, 2022 Regular Commission Meeting**

Commissioner Pang requested that the spelling of Mr. Burt Lum’s name be corrected on page 4.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Pang moved to approve the minutes of July 1, 2022 Regular Commission Meeting with the requested correction. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pescaia.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by all Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye

### **III. PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Chair Kaakua stated that the public was welcomed to make comments at any time during the meetings. No public comments were made at that time.

### **IV. ACTION ITEMS**

#### **A. Review and Approve Legislative Positions for 2023 Session**

ED Nāho‘opi‘i requested that the Commission approve the legislative positions as presented. He reviewed the handout included in the Commission packet. The requests for this session include making the one-time \$400,000 allocation a recurring allocation, request for funding for new positions as well as transfer of KIRC personnel and operating funds to a newly established KIRC Program ID. Additionally, the KIRC would request funding for additional field positions in the secondary budget request which would be presented to the new incoming governor. One other request not included in the handout was an increase in funding for rent as the rent has increased for the current office space.

Commissioner Case stated that she would abstain from this item as she had in the past so that there would be no interference with the DLNR budget. She also noted that based the Council on Revenue projections will determine if there will be operations funds that could be long-term so receiving recurring funding may be a challenge.

Chair Kaakua commented that he thought this list was good. He asked if the three new positions listed in Item 4 were actually restoring previous positions. ED Nāho‘opi‘i responded yes and explained the one of the Ocean Resources Specialists’ positions was currently grant funded. Staff hoped they would be able to roll the position into a general funded position at the end of the grant period. Chair Kaakua agreed with this approach.

Chair Kaakua asked if the separate program id discussed in Item 3 was new and whether this was only for the KIRC or if other offices were funded at the program level. ED Nāho‘opi‘i responded the KIRC previously had its funding placed in the DLNR Chair’s budget. The current idea is to have the KIRC, Aha Moku and Mauna Kea Stewardship and Oversight Authority assigned separate program id which will help the department and these agencies keep track of funding and expenditures.

Chair Kaakua asked how the secondary governor’s administrative budget differs from the initial draft budget. ED Nāho‘opi‘i explained the initial instructions from Budget & Finance was to submit budget with current expenditures. Any additional requests would be put into a secondary budget for the incoming governor to review. Commissioner Case added this was due to a new administration and the very short time period before the new budget is due. The current administration organizes the budget, but it is submitted by the new administration.

Commissioner Lindsey was updated on the legislative positions after she was connected to the meeting via Zoom.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Pescaia moved to approve the legislative positions as outlined in the briefing document. Commissioner Pang seconded the motion.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by the majority of Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-abstain; Commissioner Lindsey-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye.

**B. Authorize Executive Director recruit and hire the Cultural Resource Program Coordinator position, Assign One Commissioner to Interview/Selection Panel**

ED Nāho‘opi‘i provided background of this position. It is similar to the previous Cultural Resource Project Coordinator position which had been eliminated. The title was a little different to prevent confusion on the part of the DLNR/Personnel office.

It was decided to split the original motion into two separate motions.

**MOTION:** Vice Chair Lindsey moved to authorize the Executive Director to recruit and fill the Cultural Resources Program Coordinator position. Commissioner Pang seconded the motion.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by all Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-aye; Vice Chair Lindsey-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye.

There was a discussion on who should serve on the interviewing panel.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Pang moved to appoint Chair Kaakua to serve on the interview and selection panel.

Chair Kaakua declined to serve on the panel.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Pang moved to appoint Commissioner Pescaia to serve on the interview and selection panel. Vice Chair Lindsey seconded the motion.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by all Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-aye; Vice Chair Lindsey-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i stated funding was available so staff anticipated starting the recruitment process soon and would notify Commission Pescaia of the status.

**C. Review and Approve Proposed CY2023 Access Dates and Activities for the Protect Kaho‘olawe ‘Ohana (PKO)**

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reviewed the background of the requirement for the Commission to review and approve PKO access dates and activities within the Kaho‘olawe Island

Reserve based on the Palapala 'Aelike Kahu'āina. He noted that Makahiki starts on Thanksgiving Day in 2023.

Chair Kaakua asked if the KIRC approved activities were noted in the motion memo. ED Nāho'opi'i responded they were all KIRC approved activities. The Attorney General's (AG) office would determine if specific actions were KIRC authorized activities. DAG Morris concurred.

ED Nāho'opi'i noted that these were community access dates for Hakioawa but that the Ala Loa work dates had not been compiled yet. He stated that traditionally these dates were approved administratively by the Executive Director as the Ala Loa project was a joint KIRC-PKO project.

**MOTION:** Commissioner Mataafa moved pursuant to HAR §13-261-13 and Section 8 of the Palapala 'Aelike Kahu'āina, to approve the proposed access dates and activities for the 2023 calendar year requested by the Protect Kaho'olawe 'Ohana (PKO) as KIRC approved and authorized activities. Vice Chair Lindsey seconded the motion.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by all Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-aye; Vice Chair Lindsey-aye; Commissioner Mataafa-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye.

**D. Adopt Resolution for Suzanne Case-In Recognition Of Her Contributions Toward the Healing of Kanaloa, Kaho'olawe**

ED Nāho'opi'i read the proposed resolution into the record:

WHEREAS, the term of Suzanne Case as a Commissioner and the Department of Land and Natural Resources on the Kaho'olawe Island Reserve Commission (KIRC) will come to an end on December 30, 2022 after eight noteworthy years; and

WHEREAS, Commission Case was born in Hilo and moved to Honolulu where she graduated from Punahou Schools. She attended Williams College and Stanford University, where she graduated with honors and received her law degree from Hasting College of Law, University of California, San Francisco; and

WHEREAS, Commissioner Case is a 28-year veteran of The Nature Conservancy, having served as the Hawai'i Program's Executive Director. During her years at The Nature Conservancy, she oversaw the acquisition of the Kahuku Ranch addition to Hawai'i Volcanoes National Park, eight Hawai'i Nature Conservancy preserves, Palmyra Atoll, new National Wildlife Refuges at Hakalau on the slopes of Mauna Kea and at O'ahu Forest, and assisted with the formation of watershed partnerships for forested management throughout Hawai'i; and

WHEREAS, In April 2015, the Honorable Governor Ige appointed Commissioner Case as the Chair of the State of Hawai'i's Department of Land and Natural Resources, and in accordance with Hawai'i Revised Statutes Chapter 6K, a Commissioner on the Kaho'olawe Island Reserve Commission; and

WHEREAS, Commissioner Case has been supportive of the KIRC's legislative endeavors to achieve financial stability by allowing the KIRC to work directly with legislative representatives and senators and including the KIRC's funding request within DLNR's executive budget request; and

WHEREAS, that support has over the years been successful in transitioning the KIRC's funding from a limited trust fund to state general funds through special legislation such as an Act 72, SLH 2016, Act 140, SLH 2018 and through the department's Executive Budget Requests that converted KIRC's personnel to general funded positions in Act 49, SLH 2017; and provided additional operating funds in Act 113, SLH 2019 and Act 248, SLH 2022; and

WHEREAS, Commissioner Case has provided the KIRC Commissioners and staff with valuable insight and guidance in navigating the often-fraught pathways through the state government apparatus and the equally complicated maneuverings of the state legislature; and

WHEREAS, Commissioner Case has served faithfully for eight years as a commissioner, with passion, commitment and dedication; and

WHEREAS, with Commissioner Case's term of service coming to an end, the KIRC will lose an important supporter within the State Administration with profound knowledge and expertise; and

NOW THEREFORE, on this day, the ninth day of November in the year 2022, on the island of O'ahu,

BE IT RESOLVED by the KIRC that a significant record of achievement has been accomplished by Suzanne Case in the areas of leadership and governmental support, all in the spirit of healing Kaho'olawe; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that, through the support of Suzanne Case, will help restore Kaho'olawe as a rich cultural and environmental resource for Hawai'i's people, and through her actions and support, Kaho'olawe has become a model of native Hawaiian stewardship and management; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Suzanne Case has served the KIRC with dignity and dedication; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that copies of this resolution be transmitted to Hawai'i's congressional delegation, the Governor of the State of Hawai'i, the Protect Kaho'olawe 'Ohana, the Mayor of the County of Maui, and the Chairperson and Trustees of the Office of Hawaiian Affairs.

Vice Chair Lindsey stated that Commissioner Case had been a great help to the Kaho‘olawe Island Reserve Commission, and it was a pleasure to have her serve with them, but what was more monumental was that she was the Chair of the Department of Land and Natural Resources for the last eight years which was one of the most difficult positions in the state. She also wanted to give her accolades for how she had served our people.

**MOTION:** Vice Chair Lindsey moved to adopt the for Suzanne Case-In Recognition Of Her Contributions Toward the Healing of Kanaloa, in Kaho‘olawe. Commissioner Pescaia seconded the motion.

**Discussion:** Commissioner Pang noted that Commissioner Case’s dedication to the Commission; been very attentive at each meeting and provided important information at each meeting. She would be a great loss and he thanked her for her commitment and her aloha ‘āina from Kumukahi all the way to Kure. She had done an outstanding job.

Commissioner Mataafa seconded both Vice Chair Lindsey’s and Commissioner Pang’s comments. He thanked Commissioner Case for her service.

Commissioner Pescaia stated on behalf of the Protect Kaho‘olawe ‘Ohana it was a pleasure to have been mentored under Commissioner Case as a shining example of leadership and aloha ‘āina along with consistency in working with a lens of comprehensive approach to resource management. She stated that she admired Commissioner Case’s career not just in her work with the KIRC but with all the programs under DLNR. It was truly inspiring, and it brings this beautiful peaceful feeling inside that we have had her at our helm leading and navigating us. It was really going to be a significant loss and she was emotional just thinking of Commissioner Case leaving the Commission.

Commissioner Pescaia hoped Commissioner Case had confidence in the example she had set in terms of the standards and expectations in how we should work, the way we deliver and make decisions. People often look at policy makers and staff as just following the letter of the law, but it is the way we implement the laws and the way we take into consideration everything that the laws do not cover; it was the way we really look at our ‘āina, our kai, and our community. She experienced Commissioner Case consistently pulling all of those elements together and holding a very strong and clear line always. She came to admire that and that the ‘Ohana was appreciative of her partnership, support, and aloha ‘āina. She expressed her mahalo to Commissioner Case.

Chair Kaakua expressed his thanks and appreciation for all her Commissioner Case’s efforts regarding Kaho‘olawe; she is one of

his heroes. He was always impressed by her wisdom and leadership. He noted the work being done at Miloli‘i. He stated that the KIRC really benefited from her service and example.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i expressed his thanks for her support of his out of the box thinking.

Commissioner Case thanked everyone for their kind words. She stated it was a great honor to serve on the Commission. She was personally proud of being with the Commission on this journey for Kaho‘olawe. It had been a tricky time trying to navigate stable financial life going forward. She said the staff had done a great job. It was tricky making DLNR supported the KIRC, but the staff also showed they could do it on their own. Everyone is so committed to healing Kaho‘olawe.

**ACTION:** The motion was approved by all Commissioners present via roll call: Commissioner Case-aye; Vice Chair Lindsey-aye; Commissioner Mataafa-aye; Commissioner Pang-aye; Commissioner Pescaia-aye; Chair Kaakua-aye.

## V. ADMINISTRATIVE BUSINESS

### A. Executive Director’s Report

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported 16% of the FY23 budget was spent and spending was currently under budget. The KIRC has received approximately \$70,000 so far from grants which was not included in the current expenditure report. Staff expected the total to increase to \$100,000 by the end of the month.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i explained the Commission to the long-range schedule was provided in the Commission packets.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i explained that three Commissioners’ terms will expire in June 2023—Chair Kaakua’s, Vice-Chair Lindsey’s and Commissioner Mataafa’s. He noted that the new administration and its Boards & Commission staff would be quite busy so he suggested the PKO and Office of Hawaiian Affairs (OHA) submit their lists as soon as possible so that confirmation hearings could be scheduled.

Chair Kaakua replied that the PKO was already going through its selection process for his seat. He suggested that staff send a letter to OHA notifying them of the need to submit a list to the Governor for Vice-Chair Lindsey’s seat. ED Nāho‘opi‘i responded that a letter would be sent to OHA and a letter would be sent later to the mayor of Maui County per Commissioner Mataafa’s suggestion.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported that two Ocean Program positions were filled—one regular position (previously held by Courtney Kerr) filled by Ms. Caroline Sabharwal and the other was a 2-year CWC grant funded position filled by Ms. Christina Wine. In addition to describing the Cultural Resources Project Manager’s position, staff was

also in the process of redescribing the Reserve Operations Manager to oversee operations program including boat operations, the Base Camp management contract, supply logistics and safety.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported that there were still problems with the reverse osmosis (RO) system on island, specifically the underwater pipes which transport sea water to the RO system were damaged during the large south shore swell several months ago. Water was being transported from water catchments to Base Camp via truck. That water was run through the RO system. Additionally, there were problems with the ‘Ōhua. Staff was hoping to complete repairs by the end of this week or next week. Repairs needed to be done to the jet drive. Once the boat repairs were finished, staff would go to Kaho‘olawe to repair the underwater line.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported due to the water issue, the number of volunteers had to be reduced since there is a high ration water restriction. The Kanapou accesses have had to be delayed since the priority was to get sea water intake back to generate potable water so the camp can fully function. He noted that the Pacific Whale Foundation donated one of their boats to take volunteers to Kaho‘olawe on Monday and will bring them back on Friday. Staff was very appreciative of this help.

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported that staff was still working on scope of work for the \$500,000 CIP project; the scope of work was previously reported at the previous KIRC meeting.

Vice-Chair Lindsey was excused at 1:45 pm.

### **C. Review Expenditures as of September 30, 2022**

ED Nāho‘opi‘i noted that the expenditure report was included in the Commission packet.

There was a break from 2:02 pm to 2:08 pm. Commissioner Case was excused at 2:06 pm.

## **VI. PROJECT STATUS UPDATES**

### **A. Status Update on Current Commission/Administration Projects**

1. KIRC Virtual Museum-Stage 3: Collaborations & Special Collections (IMLS3)

CC Gavagan reported that all deliverables were achieved for this project. All required reports were submitted along with the request for payment. Staff would continue to catalog items in the PastPerfect database and publish the appropriate items in the new Kaho‘olawe Living Library website.

2. KIRC Live-Stream and VR Expedition Project (IMLS 4)

PIS Pulver reported that all tools were functioning for this project and that the project was close to being finished. A presentation regarding this project was presented at the recent ATALM Conference through the IMLS grantee meeting. She also explained that the latest IMLS grant project (IMLS 5) would provide funding to reoutfit the entire KIRC staff with mobile working units, allowing staff to be more efficient in the field in terms of data gathering and analysis. This project runs through 2025.



PIS Pulver also provided an updated on the NAWCA grant which focuses on two wetlands in Kealialalo and Keanakeiki. Currently, staff and volunteers have been doing invasive plant removals. Staff was anticipating starting planting of native plants in the rainy season. This grant also runs through 2025.

**B. Status Update on Current Restoration Program Projects:**

1. Hakioawa Operations and Maintenance Plan 2021 (DOH V)

ED Nāho‘opi‘i reported that all work was completed for this project. DOH staff traveled to Kaho‘olawe to inspect the grant project work area. DOH also accepted the Kamohio Watershed plan as an approved priority work plan which means that it does qualify for DOH funding. Staff may apply during the next grant funding cycle.

Commissioner Mataafa asked if it would be possible to view changes in the project area over time virtually and how often are photos taken. Staff have been discussing setting up a website showing all the work areas and their progression over time. Staff could also create a private map via Google Drive for Commission’s use. Also, staff thinking of establishing program pages connected to the KIRC home webpage which would allow people to see the progression. ED Nāho‘opi‘i stated that staff would start to update the KIRC webpage that would include dashboard items and send out notifications when there are updates to them. Commissioner Mataafa said there was no rush, but he remembered going out to Kaho‘olawe in 2019 and working on a project and he was interested in seeing the progress made. Commissioner Pang also commented it was a good idea to make the information since a lot of volunteers probably wanted to see how the projects they worked on have progressed. Staff was also looking at getting funding through IMLS for geotagging for plantings. Staff also distributed the pamphlet printed with information about this project.

2. Soil Enrichment Trials in Degraded Coastal Wetland Areas (Biochar)

PIS Pulver reported that this project of soil enrichment was completed, and payment was received so this would be the last report on the project.

3. Ka Palupalu o Kanaloa Partnership Project

PIS Pulver reported that the Ka Palupalu o Kanaloa working group met this Monday and there was discussion of transplanting three Kanaloa plants to Hakioawa. Seven more cuttings have been rooted in a fog box on Maui. Maui Nui Botanical Garden (MNBG) was awarded a small grant to construct 4 x 4 planter boxes and create hurricane shelters at MNBG and Kahanu Garden.

**C. Status Update on Current Ocean Program Projects:**

1. Marine Science Education and Training from a Hawaiian Perspective on Kaho‘olawe: A Pilot Project for Maui Youth (NOAA PIRO Grant)

ORPM Tokishi reported all deliverables were met for this project and full payment was received, therefore, this would be the last report for this project.

2. Marine Debris Removal from Kanapou on Kaho‘olawe (NFWF Marine Debris Grant)

ORMP Tokishi reported that a 6-month extension for this project (to June 2023) was requested due to transport issues. Some of the debris was going to

repurposed by Malama Maui Nui for building material. Two accesses to Kanapou were planned.

3. Coastal and Upland Wetland Restoration of Kahoolawe, HI (CWC Grant) ORMP Tokishi reported 4000 plants have been planted along the coast. A second person has been hired for this project. She was a great addition.

**VII. ANNOUNCEMENTS/FYI**

No announcements were made by the Commission.

**VIII. NEXT MEETING AND FOLLOW UPS**

Staff anticipated the next KIRC meeting to be held in February 2023.

**IX. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 2:28 pm.

**DRAFT**